

Item Subject: DEPUTY SECRETARY'S 9/16 AND 9/19 MEETINGS WITH UKRAINIAN NSDC SECRETARY

DECLASSIFIED

PAGE 01 STATE 205479 021823Z OCT 96

EXDIS, USVIENNA FOR USDEL CSCE

RELEASE IN FULL

SUBJECT: DEPUTY SECRETARY'S 9/16 AND 9/19 MEETINGS WITH UKRAINIAN NSDC SECRETARY HORBULYN

DECLASSIFIED

1. classified by eur/wst director jack segal. reasons 1.5 (b) and (d).

2. ~~(c)~~ SUMMARY: Deputy Secretary Talbott met September 16 and 19 with Ukrainian National Security Council Chairman Volodymyr Horbulyn to discuss European security and NATO, nuclear weapons in NATO. The discussion included the issue of how to record in a document Ukraine's enhanced relationship with NATO, the NATO/Russia relationship, nuclear weapons deployments in NATO member states, Ukraine's stance on proposing a nuclear weapons-free zone in central and eastern Europe, and the relationship between NATO, the EU and WEU. END SUMMARY.

3. ~~(c)~~ The Deputy Secretary, accompanied by Ambassador-at-Large Collins, discussed a wide range of European security issues with Volodymyr Horbulyn,

Secretary of Ukraine's National Security and Defense Council (NSDC) in two separate meetings in Washington September 16 and 19. Horbulyn was accompanied by General Smeshko, Amb. Shcherbak, DCM Kuchinsky, DATT Colonel Havrylov, and special assistant Voitko. Also attending were D Executive Assistant Edelman, EtJR/WST director Segal, s/p's Weiss and Ukraine desk officer Connuck.

NATO and European Security

4. ~~(c)~~ The Deputy Secretary outlined the USG's views of a future security architecture for Europe that would have NATO serving as the basis for the continent's collective security. Citing the fact that European states desiring NATO membership are in varying states of readiness for joining, Horbulyn suggested that a process of developing ties first with the EU, then the WEU, then going on eventually to NATO membership might provide a model for bringing new states into NATO.

5. ~~(c)~~ The Deputy Secretary noted that plans for giving a greater security role to the WEU were far from realization. making NATO the only real option at present. He said the U.S. sees the EU's relationship

Item Subject: DEPUTY SECRETARY'S 9/16 AND 9/19 MEETINGS WITH UKRAINIAN NSDC SECRETARY

with NATO as one of coordination. Declining to accept the idea of a mechanistic linkage between EU (and/or WEU) and NATO membership, he emphasized that the U.S. intends to ensure that NATO expands in a constructive way that enhances Ukraine's security. But only NATO can play the necessary leadership role in developing the security system for the new Europe, he argued.

Russian Views on NATO

6. ~~(c)~~ Horbulyn mentioned the Czech republic, Poland and Hungary as the countries most prepared for NATO membership. A second tranche cited consisted of Bulgaria, Romania, Slovakia and the Baltic states (which he said look increasingly westward for their national security). Obstacles to NATO expansion include the state of economic and military development in each potential new member-state, the existence of unresolved territorial claims among them, and the potential reaction of neighbors, particularly Russia. He noted that Russia's views on expansion had evolved from outright rejection, to statements by Foreign Minister Primakov suggesting

that expansion in the context of the OSCE might warrant discussion, to the recent proposal for a NATO/Russia charter. He noted, however, that Yeltsin's health problems may have temporarily halted Russia's ability to act on this issue.

Nuclear weapons and NATO

7. ~~(c)~~ Asked what aspects of NATO expansion worry Ukraine, Horbulyn cited the deployment of nuclear weapons on its borders as a consequence of NATO expansion. Having taken the very difficult political and moral step of becoming a non-nuclear state, Horbulyn said NATO expansion without assurances on nuclear weapons deployment would be a political disaster for the Kuchma government. (He mentioned that President Kuchma had just signed a decree directing the elimination of all SS-19 silos by the end of 1998, and mentioned that ten SS-19 silos have already been eliminated, with 33 more to be destroyed in the nearest future.)

8. ~~(c)~~ Horbulyn suggested that NATO's expansion really had two entirely different aspects if one differentiates between expansion with nuclear weapons or without. So long as nuclear weapons deployments to new NATO member-states remains an option, Horbulyn said Russia will consider deploying tactical nuclear weapons to Kaliningrad and Belarus. Therefore, he said the idea of

Item Subject: DEPUTY SECRETARY'S 9/16 AND 9/19 MEETINGS WITH UKRAINIAN NSDC SECRETARY

pursuing a Russia/NATO charter is a good one -- it would add some bricks to the framework of the collective security system.

9. (S) The Deputy Secretary acknowledged Ukraine's position on the question of nuclear deployments on its borders. He said on this point Ukraine and Russia agree, though their motives differ. The Deputy Secretary said the U.S. is trying to make sure that NATO adopts a realistic, responsible position on nuclear weapons that does not provoke feelings of instability. Specifically with regard to Ukraine, he said we would make sure that our plans and policies on the disposition of nuclear weapons never give Ukraine cause to regret its 1994 decision to rid itself of nuclear weapons. But he added that we need to balance that objective with the need to avoid creating two tiers of NATO membership. NATO must remain a unified alliance of equals. To help improve Ukraine's understanding of how we can balance these

goals, the Deputy Secretary offered a briefing on NATO's nuclear planning (delivered September 19 by Assistant Defense Secretary Frank Miller)

10. (S) The Deputy Secretary pointed out that Ukraine's proposal for a nuclear weapons free zone in central and eastern Europe was not a good idea. (Later, the Ukrainian embassy delivered a letter to the Deputy Secretary dated September 18, signed by Ambassador Shcherbak which stated, "...I have been officially instructed by Foreign Minister Hennady Udovenko, with whom I spoke this afternoon, that Ukraine has no intention to raise the issue of the establishment of a nuclear weapon-free zone in central and eastern Europe at the United Nations."

NATO/Ukraine, NATO/Russia Charters

11. (S) Citing Ukraine's active role in PFP, exercise Peace Shield," and its agreement in principle to establish a NATO information center in Kiev, Horbulyn said that whenever Ukraine achieves progress with NATO, Russia reacts strongly. He said that if Russia decides that nuclear weapons could be redeployed on its western border, it will look for a forceful way to respond, most likely by increasing political and economic pressure on Ukraine. In that eventuality, Ukraine would need some form of guarantees that its interests would be protected. He suggested that a NATO/Ukraine charter, signed in conjunction with agreement on a NATO/Russia charter would be the most stabilizing approach.

Item Subject: DEPUTY SECRETARY'S 9/16 AND 9/19 MEETINGS WITH UKRAINIAN NSDC SECRETARY

Ukraine's Relationship with NATO

12. ~~(S)~~ The Deputy Secretary said that he, the President, Mr. Lake and the Secretary, have acknowledged Ukraine's leading role in central and eastern Europe. It follows then that NATO must have a steadily strengthening relationship with Ukraine as it expands. The relationship must include that possibility that Ukraine might at some future date decide to join NATO. That decision is for Ukraine to make. In the meantime, the Deputy Secretary cited two things NATO will not do: 1) put pressure on Ukraine to apply for membership in NATO, and 2) accept anyone else's attempt to exclude Ukraine from eligibility for membership in NATO.

NATO Expansion and Russia

13. ~~(S)~~ The Deputy Secretary noted that this was far from an abstract expression of policy. He said one Russian official recently said that Russia wants it understood that the Baltic states and Ukraine could never be allowed to join NATO. He said that the U.S. has made very clear that such a position is unacceptable on its face and that a Russian position on NATO that includes that proviso would "go nowhere." The Germans, French and British have conveyed the same message to Russia.

14. ~~(S)~~ The Deputy Secretary said that the President and the Secretary believe it would be for NATO and Russia to develop a positive, constructive relationship. This was the logic behind the Secretary's Stuttgart speech and the idea of a charter with Russia. The concept is not simply to calm Russian fears, but to ensure that Russia respects the right of every country to make its own decisions vis-a-vis NATO -- particularly Ukraine.

15. ~~(S)~~ The Deputy Secretary said it was clear that each country would proceed at its own pace in developing its relationship with NATO, but it was essential that the process be transparent. He stressed that NATO's door must be open and never exclude the Baltic states, Ukraine or any other democratic country. He said the U.S. would fight to maintain an open process.

CHRISTOPHER

~~SECRET~~

PTP8275

~~SECRET~~

PTP8275

Item Subject: DEPUTY SECRETARY'S 9/16 AND 9/19 MEETINGS WITH UKRAINIAN NSDC SECRETARY

PAGE 01 STATE 205479 021826Z

@INFO: ACDA(01) CIAE(00) DODE(00) E(01) G(01)
IO(01) L(01) M(01) NSCE(00) PA(01)
PM(01) SCT(01) SIR(00) SP(01) SRPP(00)
T(01) UNW(00) USIE(00) X(00)
===== 021447L OCT 96 MMG (TOTAL COPIES:011)

@ACTION: EUR(01)

@INFO: CMS(00) D(00) EAO(00) INR(00) INR(01)
MR(01) P(01) S(01) SS(01) SSO(01)
===== 021440L OCT 96 MRK (TOTAL COPIES:007)

@INFO: SSO(00) WO(00)
===== 021919Z OCT 96 StPS (TOTAL COPIES:000)

ORIGIN SS-00

INFO LOG-00 OASY-00 ADS-00 /000R

205479

SOURCE: KODAKC.020055

DRAFTED BY: EUR/WST:JDSEGAL:JS

APPROVED BY: THE DEPUTY SECRETARY

S/NIS:J HERBST, D:E EDELMAN, S/P:A WEISS

S/S :ADWOLFF ,S/S-O :JLECROY

-----6B9AFA 021828Z /38

P 021823Z OCT 96
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO AMEMBASSY KIEV PRIORITY
INFO ALL NATO POST COLLECTIVE PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY MOSCOW PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY MINSK PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY CHISINAU PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY WARSAW PRIORITY
USMISSION USUN NEW YORK PRIORITY

~~SECRET~~ STATE 205479

EXDIS, USVIENNA FOR USDEL CSCE

E.O. 12958: DECL: 9/24/06

TAGS: PREL, PARM, UP, US